Application Ref: NP/17/0574/FUL

Case Officer Andrew Richards

Applicant Mr D Slade

Agent Mr S Hole, Steve Hole Architects

Proposal Alteration to existing boundary walls and creation of a

new dwelling

Site Location Velfrey Cottage, Church Terrace, Saundersfoot,

Pembrokeshire, SA69 9HD

Grid Ref SN13540499

Date Valid 20-Nov-2017 Target Date 21-Mar-2018

The application was deferred at 14th March 2018 Development Management Committee to allow members to undertake a site visit which was undertaken on 26th March 2018.

Consultee Response

Saundersfoot Community Council: Objection

PCNPA Tree and Landscape Officer: Conditional consent

PCNPA Park Direction: Support

PCNPA Planning Ecologist: Conditional consent

PCNPA Buildings Conservation Officer: Conditional consent

PCNPA Access Manager: No objection

PCC Transportation and Environment: Conditional consent

PCC Public Protection: No objection

PCC Drainage Engineers: Conditional consent Natural Resources Wales: No adverse comments Dwr Cymru Welsh Water: Conditional consent

Coal Authority: No objection

Public Response

A site notice and neighbour notification letters were posted in accordance with requirements of the Town and Country Planning (Development Management Procedure) (Wales) Order 2012.

Five letters of objection have been received from neighbours at Sunny Nook (2 No), Wood View (2 No) and 4 Church Terrace. These letters raise the following matters:

- Excessive two storey scale on elevated position
- Traffic and pedestrian safety and disruption to traffic and emergency services
- Overlooking and impact on privacy to neighbours
- Use of pavement by school children
- Obstruction of entrance to Wogan Lane from new delivery bay
- Location of proposal to immediate adjacent buildings and possible structural damage to chapel foundations from construction work
- Design not in-keeping with surrounding buildings
- Proposal does not enhance the Conservation Area and is out of character
- Proposed access to new dwelling should be shared with Velfrey Cottage to ensure the top of the site is retained as lawn and a landscaped area

The above matters have been considered in the main report below.

Policies considered

Please note that these policies can be viewed on the Policies page Pembrokeshire Coast National Park website -

http://www.pembrokeshirecoast.org.uk/default.asp?PID=549

LDP Policy 01 - National Park Purposes and Duty

LDP Policy 04 - Saundersfoot Local Centre

LDP Policy 08 - Special Qualities

LDP Policy 10 - Local Sites of Nature Conservation or Geological Interest

LDP Policy 11 - Protection of Biodiversity

LDP Policy 15 - Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park

LDP Policy 29 - Sustainable Design

LDP Policy 30 - Amenity

LDP Policy 31 - Minimising Waste

LDP Policy 32 - Surface Water Drainage

LDP Policy 44 - Housing

LDP Policy 45 – Affordable housing

LDP Policy 52 - Sustainable Transport

LDP Policy 53 - Impacts on traffic

PPW9 Chapter 03 - Making and Enforcing Planning Decisions

PPW9 Chapter 04 - Planning for Sustainability

PPW9 Chapter 05 - Conserving and Improving Natural Heritage and the Coast

PPW9 Chapter 08 - Transport

PPW9 Chapter 09 - Housing

PPW9 Chapter 12 - Infrastructure and Services

PPW9 Chapter 13 - Minimising and Managing Environmental Risks and Pollution

SPG05 - Sustainable Design

SPG06 - Landscape

SPG08 - Affordable Housing

SPG11 - Coal Works - Instability

SPG12 - Parking

SPG17 - Conservation Area Proposals

SPG20 - Accessibility

SPG22 - Seascape Character

SPG23 - Enabling Sustainable Development in Welsh NPAs

TAN 02 - Planning and Affordable Housing

TAN 05 - Nature Conservation and Planning

Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Authority Development Management Committee – 25th April 2018 TAN 06 - Planning for Sustainable Rural Communities

TAN 12 - Design

TAN 15 - Development and Flood Risk

TAN 18 - Transport

TAN 24 - The Historic Environment

Constraints

Special Area of Conservation - within 500m Biodiversity Issue Rights of Way Inland - within 50m LDP Centre:60pc aff housing;30 units/ha Recreation Character Areas Surface Coal High Coal Risk Landscape Character Assessment Seascape Character Assessment

Officer's Appraisal

Background and History

The application site is located within the centre of Saundersfoot along Church Terrace which is a one way road system between High Street and Frances Lane. The site is currently part of Velfrey Cottage's garden area and has an elevated position above Church Terrace with the remains of a static caravan and overgrown vegetation covering most of the site.

- NP/03/119 Replace caravan with Timber Chalet Approved 23.05.2003
- NP/17/0381/OUT New dwelling Withdrawn 29.06.2017
- NP/17/0447/FUL Part demolition of existing stone wall and provision of new 2 storey 4 bedroom dwelling and associated external work within garden area – Withdrawn 17.08.2017

Current Proposal

Planning approval is sought for the sub-division of the garden of Velfrey Cottage to form a plot for a new two storey three bedroomed residential dwelling. The proposed works will alter the existing stone frontage boundary wall to create a new access and delivery bay. Above the wall a lean-to en-suite and external log store will be provided which will also extend the stone wall vertically.

Key Issues

The application raises the following planning matters:-

- Policy, Principle of Development and Impact on National Park
- Impact on the Conservation Area
- Affordable Housing
- Siting and Sustainable Design
- Amenity and Privacy

- Highway Safety and Access
- Landscaping
- Biodiversity
- Land Stability
- Land Drainage and Flooding
- Other Material Considerations

Policy, Principle of Development and Impact on National Park:

Saundersfoot Community Council objects to the application as they consider the current proposal fails to harmonise with the landform and landscape character of the National Park under Policy 15 criteria d.

The site lies within the local centre of Saundersfoot as defined within the Local Development Plan (LDP) and the proposal to sub-divide the site and provide an additional residential dwelling with associated external works within the local centre area is considered to be acceptable in principle.

The original application (NP/17/0381/OUT refers) raised concerns in the minds of officers regarding the resulting visual intrusion on the street scene and thus was considered to be insensitively sited within the site. The agent has now submitted amendments which have addressed these concerns. The amended scheme is considered to meet criteria d of policy 15 in that the current proposal now enhances the landform and landscape character of this area of the National Park.

The proposal provides enhancement works to a prominent stone boundary wall within this street frontage and this together with the associated landscaping will assist in opening up the existing landscape character of this street. This will in turn also open up views of the adjacent Chapel from the lower parts of Church Terrace.

The comments of the community council noted above are accordingly not supported by officers who consider the proposed scale of the amended development to be appropriate for the site. The layout has been designed carefully to fit in with the site and its context. Therefore, in this instance it is considered that the proposal will not have an adverse impact on the National Park and the surrounding landscape. The proposal is also considered to meet the policies set out in the Local Development Plan.

Impact on the Conservation Area:

Saundersfoot Community Council has indicated that the proposed development is not in-keeping with the objectives of the Saundersfoot Conservation Area due to the proportions of the dwelling within its plot together with the proposed form and materials.

The current proposed scheme is considered to succeed in preserving the street boundary which was a concern initially. In terms of overall form, the proposed new dwelling is considered to add architectural interest and responds well to the existing site levels on this challenging site whilst also providing valuable amenity areas to the north, east and south of the dwelling.

The glazing has been simplified and the proposed lean-to aspect extending up from the existing stone boundary wall adds a traditional design detail to the proposed form of the new dwelling. The materials are considered to compliment the proposed design whilst also matching other dwellings within the locality. Notwithstanding the above considerations, planning conditions on landscaping and a sample panel of stone work should be imposed on any consent to ensure that the character and appearance of the conservation area is maintained and enhanced.

Affordable Housing:

Policy 6 of the LDP requires consideration of the need for affordable housing where new units of residential accommodation are proposed and Policy 45 of the LDP seeks to deliver affordable housing in the National Park. It is recognised that there is a need for affordable housing within Saundersfoot, and the threshold for negotiating provision of units is two or more residential units. The current proposal for one new unit of residential accommodation is under this threshold. Therefore on-site provision will not be sought and a financial contribution towards affordable housing in the local area is required through a Unilateral Undertaking.

This contribution is calculated at £150/m². A Planning Obligation in the form of a Unilateral Undertaking has been executed and submitted in support of the application, and therefore the proposal is considered to be acceptable in respect of affordable housing.

Siting and Sustainable Design:

Policy 8 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan (LDP) is a strategic policy which refers to the special qualities of the National Park and lists priorities to ensure that these special qualities will be protected and enhanced. Policy 15 of the LDP seeks the conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park with criteria 'a' and 'b' resisting development that would cause significant visual intrusion and/or, that would be insensitively and unsympathetically sited within the landscape. Criteria 'd' and 'e' resists development that would fail to harmonise with, or enhance the landform and landscape character of the National Park, and/or fail to incorporate important traditional features.

Policy 29 of the LDP requires all development proposals to be well designed in terms of place and local distinctiveness (criterion 'a'). Policy 30 of the LDP seeks to avoid development that is of an incompatible scale with its surroundings (criterion 'b') or is visually intrusive (criterion 'd').

The siting of the proposed dwelling within the plot is considered to be acceptable given its central location allowing usable amenity space around the dwelling and also providing adequate access.

The concerns raised on lack of information regarding the lack of a structural assessment on the integrity of the existing stone wall and earth bank above along the western boundary together, with details on how the new dwelling will be constructed within a constrained footprint in the centre of the village can be addressed via a Construction Management Plan condition.

The current scheme is now gable fronted to Church Terrace which assists with its scale and form when viewed from the street scene. The traditional form and mix of traditional and modern materials are considered to complement the proposed design which offers contemporary features and fenestration. The layout, mix of materials and design features are considered by officers to be appropriate in this instance and provide a sustainable design which can be supported.

Amenity and Privacy:

Policies 29 and 30 of the Local Development Plan seek to protect community cohesion and health and to avoid incompatible development that would lead to a significant adverse impact upon amenity. The supporting text at paragraph 4.136 explains that the policy aims "to protect the amenity enjoyed by people in their residences, workspaces and recreational areas. Amenity is defined as those elements in the appearance and layout of town and countryside which makes for pleasant life rather than mere existence. Anything ugly, dirty, noisy, crowded, intrusive or uncomfortable is likely to adversely affect amenity".

Policy 30 is a criteria based policy setting out that development will not be permitted where it has an unacceptable impact on amenity particularly where, a) the development is for a use inappropriate for where people live or visit and/or; b) the development is of a scale incompatible with its surroundings; and/or; c) the development leads to an increase in traffic or noise or odour or light which has a significant adverse impact; and/or; d) the development is visually intrusive.

Three letters from neighbours at Sunny Nook, Wood View and 4 Church Terrace has been received highlighting concerns with overlooking and privacy from the fenestration on the new dwelling. Upon receipt of the latest plans the neighbour at Sunny Nook has removed their objection on overlooking and privacy given that the amended drawings now include louvres which prevent any overlooking of this property.

The neighbouring property 4 Church Terrace is at a distance in excess of 21 metres from any new fenestration which would be at a level to overlook this property. The current design of the new dwelling will have one window at first floor level facing the neighbour at Wood View however, this window will serve the master bedroom ensuite and conditions will be added to ensure that this window is provided in obscure glazing and has a top opening aspect to ensure there is no unacceptable privacy or amenity impact on the neighbour.

The proposed Construction Management Plan previously mentioned will also include a requirement for any methods of dust suppression to ensure the amenity of neighbours. As such, it is considered that there will be no adverse impact on privacy or amenity in this instance.

Highway Safety and Access:

Saundersfoot Community Council has indicated that the proposal does not include a Traffic Management Plan to explain how traffic on the adjacent single carriageway 'Church Terrace' could be maintained during construction works. In addition the existing pedestrian footway (which is the main walking route to Saundersfoot Community Primary School) will be impacted significantly during construction works in general and especially during any works to demolish/replace/repair sections of the existing stone boundary wall which is immediately adjacent to the footway. The Community Council would be concerned if this footway had to be closed during construction works.

The Community Council also noted that the loading bay could not be enforced as such and fully expects this to become a parking bay, as there is no other provision within the development for such a parking space. Several letters from neighbours

also raise similar concerns on the impact to the adjacent highway and potential lack of access for emergency vehicles.

Policies 52 and 53 of the Local Development Plan refer to sustainable transport and the traffic impacts of proposed development. Pembrokeshire County Council Transportation and Environment section has indicated that the construction of a new retaining wall on the frontage could cause traffic congestion and problems for pedestrians on the footway.

As such, a planning condition should be imposed in the form of a Construction Management Plan to include details of the Traffic Management that will need to be agreed in writing with the National Park Authority and should include details on maximum vehicle sizes, number of vehicles and routes to be used along with times at which deliveries will occur to avoid peak activities and any measures required to maintain road safety. The plan should also include details on parking of vehicles and storage of materials. It is considered that this condition is sufficient to control these aspects and will ensure adequate and safe access is achieved during the construction period.

With regard to the proposed loading bay and the concerns raised by the Community Council, Pembrokeshire County Council Transportation and Environment section confirm that this area will be provided behind the existing footway and will also provide the only access to the new dwelling. Although parking provision is not a requirement as the site is within Zone 1 of the adopted Parking guidelines, the access and loading bay can be accepted off this one-way street and no objections on highway grounds have been raised.

Landscaping:

The application included a tree report which stated that there are no trees to meet BS5837 requirement present on the site. This report also indicated that the existing over mature shrubs add little to the aesthetics of the site and will need to be cleared to allow the development to be carried out on site.

The proposed drawings include replacement landscaping in the form of boundary tree and hedge landscaping and garden areas laid to lawn together with a turf roof system over the proposed ancillary storage buildings within the northern part of the site. No specific details have been submitted to clarify what type of planting is proposed in these areas and a planning condition will be imposed to ensure these details are sufficient to ensure that the character of the Conservation Area and the surrounding landscape in maintained and enhanced.

Biodiversity:

PPW, TAN5 and LDP policy 11 requires biodiversity and landscape considerations to be taken into account in determining individual applications. The presence of a species protected under UK or European legislation is a material consideration when dealing with applications that are likely to result in disturbance or harm to the species or its habitat.

The PCNPA Ecologist has commented on the application stating that a survey was undertaken with the report concluding that there was no evidence of bats being present on the site and no further survey work is required, but the report also

recommends a precautionary approach to the works given the likelihood of nesting birds being present at certain times of the year.

As such, the proposed works to remove vegetation must avoid the bird nesting season and all other works are to be carried out in accordance with the submitted ecological report. These aspects will be imposed as planning conditions and the proposal subject to the conditions will conform with relevant requirements of PPW, TAN5 and LDP policy 11.

Land Stability:

The site is located within an area defined by The Coal Authority as containing potential high risk hazards arising from coal mining and falls within the defined Coal Mining Development Referral Area. A Coal Mining Risk Assessment (CMRA) report has been submitted to support the current application.

The Coal Authority has reviewed the existing mining information and the submitted CMRA report and confirms that the coal outcrop is to the south of the application site and dips to the south, thereby not underlying the site. Consequently, the report concludes that the risks posed by shallow coal mine workings are negligible. Accordingly, no precautionary measures or further investigations are considered necessary.

The Coal Authority considers that the content and conclusions of the submitted CMRA report are sufficient for the purposes of the planning process in demonstrating that the application site is safe and stable for the proposed development. The Coal Authority therefore has no objection to the proposed development.

Land Drainage and Flooding:

Policy 29 of the LDP requires all development proposals to be well designed in terms of water and drainage (criterion 'h'), policy 32 requires development proposals to incorporate sustainable drainage systems for the disposal of surface water on site.

The application has indicated that foul water will be discharged in the mains sewer and surface water will discharge into soakaways. Pembrokeshire County Council Drainage Engineers have been consulted and support the application subject to the discharge of surface water being directed to new soakaways or other form of sustainable drainage system. If, however, ground conditions are not suitable for the use of soakaways/infiltration type SuDS, an alternative method of disposal will be required, which should be agreed in writing with the local planning authority.

Other Material Considerations:

Saundersfoot Community Council has asked for confirmation that the proposed development would not impact on the adjoining Hebron Chapel.

It is noted that the chapel will remain pre-eminent in views down Church Terrace – the chapel is a prominent gabled structure standing in its own plot. The development site provides an area of greenery adjacent (mostly un-cultivated) with an attractive backdrop of St Brides Hill. All of this is arguably incidental to the historic setting of the chapel, which like its counterparts across Wales was intended to be as pre-eminent as funds, topography and streetscape allowed, so as to define its status.

Given the distance of the proposed dwelling, its downslope siting and the latest design, which are considered to be unobtrusive, it is considered that there will be little adverse impact on the adjacent Chapel. As for preserving some of the incidental setting, the proposed railings to be located along parts of the boundary with the Chapel will assist and this will be controlled by way of a planning condition and much of the attractive hinterland will remain visible.

Current views of the chapel from the lower end of Church Terrace are very limited due to the existing tree canopies which obscure views to the side elevation. This elevation only appears visible when nearing the head of the street – these views will improve through the removal of the overgrown landscaping within the top section of the site and therefore the Chapel will have a greater degree of prominence through the current proposal when viewed from the lower end of Church Terrace.

Saundersfoot Community Council has expressed concerns with regard to the principle of building a new dwelling on an elevated site which may be supported by a stone retaining wall and earth bank with no structural assessment submitted in support of the application. The structural integrity of the existing site stone boundary wall and hedge bank above within the site, and the method of construction can be assessed through the provision of a Construction Management Plan. This plan will also address how any construction works will provide solutions to the constrained site and challenging topography. These aspects will be covered within this document together with the other considerations mentioned above.

Conclusion

Following consideration of the policies contained within the Local Development Plan and National Planning Policy in the form of Planning Policy Wales (Edition 9, November 2016) and having regard to all material considerations it is considered that the development offers an opportunity to protect and enhance the local centre of Saundersfoot. The development will be in keeping with the aims of the LDP in that the development and will conserve and enhance the existing character of the conservation area. As such, and subject to a schedule of suitable conditions to control the development, the development is considered to be acceptable and complies with the requirements of policies 1, 4, 8, 10, 11, 15, 29, 30, 31, 32, 44, 45, 52 and 53 of the Local Development Plan.

Recommendation

Therefore, the recommendation to members is for the application to be approved subject to the following conditions:

- 1. The development shall begin not later than five years from the date of this decision.
 - **Reason:** Required to be imposed pursuant to Section 91 (1) of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 (as amended).
- 2. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans and documents:
 - Drawing ref: 1749/100 (Received 20.11.2017)

Drawing ref: 1749/101 (Received 20.09.2017)
Drawing ref: 1749/102/D (Received 21.02.2018)
Drawing ref: 1749/103/D (Received 19.02.2018)
B.S.5837 Tree Report (Received 20.09.2017)

Brief Design and Access / Conservation Area Statement (Received

20.11.2017)

Coal Mining Risk Assessment (Received 20.09.2017) Ecological Survey Report (Received 20.09.2017)

Reason: In order to be clear on the approved scheme of development in the interests of protecting visual amenity and the special qualities of the National Park. Policy: Local Development Plan – Policies 1 (National Park Purposes and Duty), 8 (Special Qualities), 15 (Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park) and 29 (Sustainable Design).

3. The development shall utilise soakaways/infiltration type SuDS to dispose of surface water. If, however, ground conditions are not suitable for the use of soakaways/infiltration type SuDS, an alternative method of disposal will be required to be submitted prior to commencement of the development, which shall be agreed, in writing, with the local planning authority. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.
Reason: To ensure that effective drainage facilities are provided for the proposed development and that no adverse impact occurs to the environment

proposed development and that no adverse impact occurs to the environment or the existing public sewerage system. Policy: Local Development Plan - Policy 29 (Sustainable Design).

- 4. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the mitigation measures within the Ecological Survey Report (Received 20.09.2017) and also ensure that no vegetation clearance is carried out on site within the bird nesting season. In addition before development commences details of external illumination, including measures to control light spillage, shall be submitted to the National Park Authority for approval, in writing. Development shall be carried out and maintained in accordance with the approved details.
 Reason: To ensure that animal and plant species which within the terms of the Conservation (Habitats 2c) Regulations 1994 are effectively protected and the Local Development Plan Policy 11 (Protection of Biodiversity).
- 5. A sample panel of suitably pointed stonework shall be prepared on site for inspection and approval, in writing, by the National Park Authority. The works shall thereafter be carried out and retained in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: To ensure a proper standard of development and appearance in the interests of conserving the amenities and special qualities of the area. Policy: Local Development Plan - Policies 1 (National Park Purposes and Duty), 15 (Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park) 29 (Sustainable Design) and 30 (Amenity).

6. No development, demolition or site clearance shall take place until there has been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority a scheme relating to the immediate landscape. The approved scheme shall include the following proposed landscaping details:

- clarification of planting / landscaping proposals
- scale plan on proposed site layout showing precise locations
- schedules of plants
- plant species
- plant supply sizes
- proposed numbers of each proposed species
- hedge planting density and method (e.g. double staggered)
- implementation programme / timescale / phasing of planting
- management and replacement of failures details
- specific planting details of green roof including list of all species proposed and cross section

Reason: In the interests of maintaining a suitable scheme of landscaping to protect the visual amenity of the area, to maintain the special qualities of the landscape and habitats through the protection, creation and enhancement of links between sites and their protection for amenity, landscape and biodiversity value. Policy: Local Development Plan – Policies 1 (National Park Purposes and Duty), 8 (Special Qualities), 11 (Protection of Biodiversity), 15 (Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park) and 30 (Amenity).

7. The en-suite window serving the master bedroom at first floor level on the approved plan ref: 1749/103/D (Received 19.02.2018) shall have obscured glazing with the opening light having a top hung aspect and shall be so maintained thereafter.

Reason: To preserve the amenity and priivacy of neighbouring properties. Policy: Local Development Plan – Policy 30 (Amenity).

- 8. No surface water and/or land drainage shall be allowed to connect directly or indirectly with the public sewerage network.
 - **Reason**: To prevent hydraulic overloading of the public sewerage system, to protect the health and safety of existing residents and ensure no pollution of or detriment to the environment. Policy: Local Development Plan Policy: 32 (Surface Water Drainage).
- 9. No development shall commence, including any site clearance or demolition works, until a Construction Management Plan has been submitted to, and approved in writing by, the local planning authority. The approved plan shall be fully adhered to throughout the construction period. The plan shall provide the following details:
 - structural appraisal of existing stone boundary wall and hedgebank above to confirm its suitability as a retaining structure;
 - storage of plant and materials used in constructing the development;
 - the erection and maintenance of security fencing, where appropriate;
 - measures to control the emission of dust and dirt during demolition and construction; and
 - a scheme for recycling/disposing of waste resulting from demolition and construction works.
 - the parking of vehicles of site operatives and visitorloading and unloading of plant and materials;
 - loading and unloading of plant and materials;
 - maximum vehicle sizes, numbers and routes to be used along with times at

which deliveries will occur to avoid conflict with peak activities; and

- measures required to maintain the existing road and pedestrian access along Church Terrace to ensure highway safety.

Reason: To reduce the likelihood of obstruction of the highway, danger to road users, to conserve public health and local amenity, to ensure satisfactory standard of sustainable development and in order to ensure a proper standard of development and appearance in the interests of conserving the amenities and special qualities of the area. Policy: Local Development Plan – Policies 1 (National Park Purposes and Duty), 8 (Special Qualities), 15 (Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park), 25 (Recycled, Secondary and Waste Materials), 29 (Sustainable Design), 30 (Amenity), 31 (Minimising Waste) and 53 (Impacts of Traffic).

The applicants attention is drawn to the consultation responses from:

Dwr Cymru/Welsh Water

Pembrokeshire County Council Transportation and Environment Section and PCNPA Tree and Landscape Officer







