Page: 1

Application Ref: NP/16/0701/FUL

Case Officer Caroline Bowen
Applicant Mr & Mrs Manby

Agent Mr J Nutting, Acanthus Holden Ltd **Proposal** Erect a 2 storey, 3 bedroom dwelling

Site Location Bryn Y Mor, Narberth Road, Tenby, Pembrokeshire,

SA70 8HT

Grid Ref SN12810118

Date Valid 23-Dec-2016 Target Date 07-Jun-2017

This application is reported to the Development Management Committee as the officer's recommendation is contrary to that of Tenby Town Council.

Consultee Response

Tenby Civic Society Chairman: Supporting Natural Resources Wales: No objection

PCNPA - Tree and Landscape Officer: Conditional consent

Natural Resources Wales: No objection

PCC - Transportation & Environment: Conditional Consent

Dwr Cymru Welsh Water: Conditional Consent - We would request that if you are minded to grant Planning Consent for the above development that Conditions and Advisory Notes with regards to Sewerage are included within the consent to ensure no detriment to existing residents or the environment and to Dwr Cymru Welsh Water's assets.

PCNPA - Ecologist: No adverse comments

Tenby Town Council: Recommend Refusal - - Town Council members feel site too small to support a development of this size and would have a detrimental effect of the light and privacy amenity of neighbouring properties in Southlands. They are also concerned about the effect of extra vehicular movements and the proposed design, which they feel is out of keeping with the existing architecture of the area. They are also unconvinced that enough protection is afforded to the Ash tree on the edge of the site which is the subject of a TPO.

Public Response

The application has been appropriately advertised in accordance with statutory requirements, including re-consultation following the receipt of amended drawings.

5 letters of objection were originally received from neighbours to the application site (including one letter representing 9 apartments at Bryn y Mor); and 3 letters were received following the re-consultation of amended plans. In summary, the issues originally raised were;

- The proposed new dwelling occupies a large proportion of the site and in our opinion is too large and represents an overdevelopment of this site.
- The proximity of the proposed new dwelling to the highway will have a
 detrimental visual effect upon the locality and the other properties within the
 vicinity.
- Insufficient off-street parking provision
- Highway safety to both vehicles and pedestrians at the junction with Narberth Road.
- Unauthorised use of access and parking at Bryn y Mor by visitors/deliveries to the application site.
- Previous applications to develop the plot were turned down as overdevelopment of the site.
- None of the properties in this area are built on the road edge the proposed dwelling would look directly into neighbouring gardens – other properties are at a reasonable distance from each other.
- Noise and disturbance from persons using the balconies to the front of the dwelling. Impact on privacy and peace of neighbouring properties.
- Negative impact on a mature ash tree, which is subject of a tree preservation order
- Loss of light and privacy, and increased overlooking.
- The proposed property would be well above Narberth Road and the visual impact would be immense.
- The development is at a high level and is both very isolated and exposed. It
 would result in a complete change of character of the Narberth Road.

Following the re-consultation of amended plans, the following comments were received (in summary);

- We are happy with the size and shape of the proposed new house, however the proposed dwelling should have the same finishes as the rest of the properties within the Bryn y Mor site.
- Despite the removal of the garage it is hard to see what else has been amended and the previous concerns still stand.
- The new house seems to be larger and has moved forward on the plot to be even nearer to the road.
- The Juliet balconies do not really address concerns in respect of privacy issues. Our privacy would be greatly compromised with the lounge and kitchen areas being on the top floor and so open to the road and overlooking our house and garden.

Policies considered

Please note that these policies can be viewed on the Policies page Pembrokeshire Coast National Park website -

http://www.pembrokeshirecoast.org.uk/default.asp?PID=549

LDP Policy 01 - National Park Purposes and Duty LDP Policy 02 - Tenby Local Service and Tourism Centre Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Authority Development Management Committee – 9th August 2017 LDP Policy 08 - Special Qualities

LDP Policy 15 - Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park

LDP Policy 29 - Sustainable Design

LDP Policy 30 - Amenity

LDP Policy 45 – Affordable housing

LDP Policy 52 - Sustainable Transport

LDP Policy 53 - Impacts on traffic

PPW9 Chapter 03 - Making and Enforcing Planning Decisions

PPW9 Chapter 04 - Planning for Sustainability

PPW9 Chapter 09 - Housing

SPG08 - Affordable Housing

TAN 02 - Planning and Affordable Housing

TAN 12 - Design

Constraints

Special Area of Conservation - within 500m LDP Centre:60pc aff housing;30 units/ha Recreation Character Areas Low Coal Risk Landscape Character Assessment Seascape Character Assessment

Officer's Appraisal

Background

The application site is a modest undeveloped plot of land, located to the northern flank of Narberth Road, and to the east of the entrance to Bryn y Mor (unrelated). Access to the site is via this existing main entrance.

The proposed plot lies in an elevated position above the level of Narberth Road, with a large specimen Ash tree - which is subject of an individual tree preservation order - to the south east corner. In the wider setting, the plot lies to the northern part of Tenby, and within a predominantly residential streetscape. To the north, the site is bordered by Bryn y Mor, a large building comprising apartments. To the east lies the small cul de sac of Southlands, with Hammonds Park guest house below. To the south, beyond Narberth Road, there are residential properties, and to the west lies the entrance to Bryn y Mor with its curtilage and parking area and residential properties/gardens beyond.

History

- NP/03/575 Pair of semi-detached dwellings. Withdrawn
- NP/04/030 Pair of semi detached dwellings. Withdrawn

• NP/04/164 – 1 Detached dwelling. Finally disposed of.

Pre-application advice on the principle of the development was originally sought, and was supported by officers subject to detailed design and the provision of an affordable housing contribution.

Constraints

- LDP Centre 50pc aff housing; 30 units/ha
- Low Coal Risk
- Recreation Character Areas
- Landscape Character Assessment
- Seascape Character Assessment
- Tree Preservation Order

Current Proposal

Full planning application is sought for the construction of a single detached dwelling, with access, parking and garden space.

The new dwelling will be two storey in scale, and sited centrally on the plot, orientated to have its front elevation facing south-east. The new access will create a short pull-in area leading to a hardstanding to the rear of the new dwelling which will accommodate 2 cars. A garden area will be retained to the front of the house, bordered by an evergreen hedge.

Key Issues

The application raises the following planning matters:-

- Policy
- Siting and design
- Amenity and Privacy
- Access and parking
- Landscaping
- Drainage/Water issues
- Other matters
- Other material considerations

Policy.

The site lies within the Centre boundary of Tenby as defined under Policy 2 of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Local Development Plan. As such, the principle of a dwelling in this location is acceptable.

On proposals for a single residential dwelling, Policy 45 (d) states that, to deliver affordable housing, the Authority will - as part of the overall housing provision - seek a commuted sum to help with the delivery of affordable housing. For this proposal,

the commuted sum is levied at £150 per square metre of gross internal floor space. The applicant has provided a completed unilateral undertaking to the Authority for the required affordable housing contribution, therefore this is in accordance with Policy 45.

Scale, siting and design.

Policy 15 refers to the conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park, with criteria (b) and (c) resisting development that would be insensitively and unsympathetically sited within the landscape, and would introduce or intensify a use which is incompatible with its location. The scale of the new property is two-storey, and, when viewed against the wider streetscene, there are existing properties of two and more storeys which form a context against which the new property would be comparable in height. The proposed plot is smaller in size than neighbouring plot sizes at this location, however, in the wider streetscape, this area of north Tenby comprises a mix of both large and small plots, and thus the proposed property would not be seen as unsympathetically sited nor incompatible with the residential character of Narberth Road.

In respect of design, the dwelling will be two-storey in mass with a slate pitched and stepped down roof profile. The walls will be plain render. There has been criticism that the proposed dwelling does not fit in with the architectural style of its surroundings. Along Narberth Road, there are properties with red tiled roofs, and Bryn y Mor is a striking example of this architectural detail. However, more modern additions along Narberth Road have used slate roofs and are of a different style and mass, which –overall – adds interest and diversity to the streetscene. The proposed dwelling uses traditional details, and - as the development is separate to Bryn y Mor, which is set back some 35m from the highway – the different finishes would not be considered to be out of keeping with the wider streetscene.

Amenity and Privacy:

Policy 30 seeks to avoid incompatible development and significant adverse impact upon the amenity enjoyed by neighbouring properties, particularly where the development is an inappropriate use, is of a scale incompatible with its surroundings, development leads to an increase in traffic, noise, odour or light or the development is visually intrusive.

In respect of amenity, the proposed dwelling would be considered compatible with the streetscene - the development would be in keeping with the built up surroundings, and would not be considered visually harmful to the character of the developed setting.

In respect of privacy, the new dwelling will sit in an elevated position above Narberth Road and there are properties surrounding the plot on all sides. To the north lies Bryn y Mor, which is a 4/5 storey block of apartments set at a higher level approximately 30 metres away from the prosed footprint. To the east lies the small cul de sac of dwellings at Southlands. Again, these dwelling are set at a higher level, and the nearest dwelling lies approximately 13 metres from the new dwelling.

Page: 5

Page: 6

Hammonds Park guest house is approximately 25 metres to the east. The eastern elevation of the proposed house will have fenestration to the ground and first floor, but these will look toward a piece of land to the entrance of Southlands as opposed to into neighbouring properties. To the west, the plot is bordered by the existing entrance to Bryn y Mor and a communal garden and parking area. To the south, the property known as The Chalet faces toward the site across Narberth Road at a distance of approximately 16 metres from the road facing elevation to the corner of the proposed dwelling. The Chalet is set down in level from Narberth Road, with a mature hedge to the front boundary. The front elevation of the proposed dwelling features Juliet balconies, as the dwelling will have upside down living accommodation. The orientation of the fenestration is oblique to The Chalet, and will be at a distance of over 20 metres from the eastern part of the front boundary of The Chalet. This is considered to be comparable with the level of separation that exists in the streetscene, and it is, therefore, considered that there is sufficient separation between the existing properties and the new property to ensure that there would be adequate privacy.

Access and parking.

Following re- consultation of the amended plans removing the proposed garage, the Highways Authority recommended conditional consent, commenting that...'The dwelling will have three bedrooms and be basically the same design as before, but without the garage. It will be relocated within the plot, and the parking will be far better than before, and now an acceptable provision.

It is now possible to condition the setting back of the proposed north-western boundary wall (and pillar) behind the lamppost, so that there is permanent visibility for vehicle drivers exiting from the driveway, but also that footway (and the service pipes and cables under the footway) can be retained in place, as was designed with the original Bryn y Mor development.'

Landscaping.

The application site does not fall within a Conservation Area, and there is a single tree preservation order on the application site. Following the submission of a detailed tree survey and method of protection for the specimen Ash during development, the Authority's Tree and Landscape Officer has recommended conditional consent, requiring further details in respect of site-specific details of proposed landscaping and new planting.

Biodiversity.

Following consultation, the Authority's Ecologist had no comments to make in respect of the proposal.

Drainage/Water issues

Policy 32 of the LDP requires development to incorporate sustainable drainage systems for the disposal of surface water on site.

Both Natural Resources Wales and Welsh Water have been consulted as to the impact of the proposal on the water and drainage environment. The Agency has raised no objection to the proposal. Welsh Water has raised no objection to the proposal subject to a condition concerning surface water drainage.

Other matters.

The concerns of Tenby Town Council and the neighbours have been carefully considered, and the issues are covered in the report above. The amended drawing sought to address the concerns in respect of the proposed parking and in respect of privacy and amenity. Whilst it is appreciated that the plot is smaller than its immediate neighbours, there is a distinct mix of both larger and smaller plots in this part of north Tenby, and it is demonstrated that the proposed dwelling would be at a sufficient distance and position to maintain the current level of amenity and privacy at this location. In the accompanying Design and Access Statement, the applicant has directly addressed the issue of amenity, particularly in respect of 1 Southlands and The Chalet:

"...The proposed dwelling has been designed to respect the proximity of the adjacent dwelling (1 Southlands) by concentrating almost all the fenestration to the southerly sides of the dwelling. On the north-west elevation there is only 1 window, to a non-habitable space. The view of this window is partially obscured by the remainder of the building. On the north-eastern elevation there are three windows. The closest to 1 Southlands is from an en-suite, a non-habitable space. The other two serve a bedroom and kitchen/dining area. Both are almost 90 degrees to the front lounge windows of 1 Southlands and around 18 m apart.

Between 1 Southlands and the proposed development site, there is a footpath with high timber fences either side.

The property the other side of Narberth Road from the proposed dwelling is known as the Chalet. The A478 road separates them. This is a trunk road with pavements either side. The closest windows in the proposed dwelling will be in the order of 17.5 metres to 18 metres from the Chalet windows. This is a similar distance, if not more, than what has been built between dwellings in Haytor Gardens and other areas in Tenby.'

Conclusion

It is considered that varying density and design can make places interesting, and that new development should take account of the prevailing relationship of buildings to landscape. In this instance, officers consider that the proposed dwelling would be acceptable at this location as it is shown that the size of the proposed dwelling plot would not be out of keeping to that of neighbouring plots in the immediate streetscene. The proposed design and external materials to be used would be considered to be in keeping with the mix of both older and modern appearance of the existing dwellings at Narberth Road, there would be sufficient private garden and amenity space for a three bedroom dwelling, which would not materially harm the

Pembrokeshire Coast National Park Authority
Development Management Committee – 9th August 2017

Page: 7

existing amenity and privacy at this location. In light of this, the proposal is considered to accord with the Local Development Plan, and can be supported by officers.

Recommendation

That the application be approved, subject to the following conditions;

Conditions/Reasons

1. The development shall begin not later than five years from the date of this decision.

Reason: Required to be imposed pursuant to Section 91 (1) of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 (as amended).

- 2. The development shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans and documents: S001 and S002 dated 23rd December 2016, P100 Rev C, P101 Rev B, P102 Rev A, P103, P200 Rev C, P201 Rev B, P300 Rev A dated 19th May 2017. Tree Protection Plan dated 23rd December 2016. Reason: In order to be clear on the approved scheme of development in the interests of protecting visual amenity and the special qualities of the National Park. Policy: Local Development Plan Policies 1 (National Park Purposes and Duty), 8 (Special Qualities), 15 (Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park) and 29 (Sustainable Design).
- 3. No development shall commence, including any works of demolition, until a Construction Method Statement has been submitted to, and approved in writing by, the local planning authority. The approved statement shall be adhered to throughout the construction period. The statement shall provide for:
 - i) the parking of vehicles of site operatives and visitors;
 - ii) loading and unloading of plant and materials;
 - iii) storage of plant and materials used in constructing the development;
 - iv) measures to control the emission of dust and dirt during demolition and construction: and
 - v) a scheme for recycling/disposing of waste resulting from demolition and construction works.

Reason: To reduce the likelihood of obstruction of the highway, danger to road users, to conserve public health and local amenity, to ensure satisfactory standard of sustainable development and in order to ensure a proper standard of development and appearance in the interests of conserving the amenities and special qualities of the area. Policy: Local Development Plan – Policies 1 (National Park Purposes and Duty), 8 (Special Qualities), 15 (Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park), 25 (Recycled, Secondary and Waste Materials), 29 (Sustainable Design), 30 (Amenity), 31 (Minimising Waste) and 53 (Impacts of Traffic).

4. Following site clearance and prior to the commencement of any construction work, site profiles of the external ground and internal finished floor levels shall be set out on site for approval by the National Park Authority. The works shall

thereafter be carried out and retained in accordance with the approved plans. **Reason:** To ensure a proper standard of development and appearance in the interests of conserving the amenities and architectural character of the area. Local Development Plan - Policies 1 - National Park Purposes and Duty, Policy 8 - Special Qualities, 15 - Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park, 29 - Sustainable Design and 30 - Amenity.

- The north western boundary wall and pillars shall be set back behind a minimum 1.5 metre footway for the Bryn y Mor development.
 Reason: In the interests of road safety. Local Development Plan Policy 53 (Impacts of Traffic).
- 6. The parking and turning area as shown on the submitted drawings shall be completed before the development is brought into use and thereafter shall be used for no purpose other than parking and turning.
 Reason: To reduce the likelihood of obstruction of the highway or danger to road users. Local Development Plan, Policy 53 Impacts of Traffic.
- 7. No development shall take place until details of soft landscape works have been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. These details shall include:
 - Planting plans
 - Written specifications (including cultivation and other operations associated with plant and grass establishment)
 - Schedules of plants, noting native species to be used on the site
 - Plant supply sizes
 - Proposed numbers/densities where appropriate
 - Implementation programme (including phasing of works where relevant)

Reason: In the interest of protecting visual amenity and the special qualities of the area. Policy: Local Development Plan - Policy: 1 (National Park Purposes and Duty), 8 (Special Qualities), 11 (Protection of Biodiversity), 15 (Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park), 30 (Amenity)

- 8. A schedule of external finishes and colours to be submitted to the National Park Authority for approval, in writing, prior to the commencement of work. The development thereafter shall be carried out and retained in accordance with the approved plans.
 - **Reason**: To ensure a proper standard of development and appearance in the interests of conserving the amenities and architectural character of the area. Local Development Plan, Policies 1 National Park Purposes and Duty, 15 Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park and 29 Sustainable Design.
- 9. No surface water shall be allowed to connect (either directly or indirectly) to the public sewerage system unles otherwise approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To protect the integrity of the Public Sewerage system. Local Development Plan - Policy 32 - Surface Water Drainage and Planning Policy Wales Edition 5 - Chapter 12.

10. Notwithstanding the provisions of Article 3 of The Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 1995, (or any Order revoking or reenacting that Order) any electricity or telephone supplies to the site shall be by underground cables.

Reason: To preserve the character of the area. Local Development Plan - Policies 1 - National Park Purposes and Duty and 15 - Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park.

11. Notwithstanding the provisions of Article 3 of The Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 1995, (relating to extensions to, and changes to the external appearance of, the dwelling and to development or the siting of a caravan within the curtilage of the dwellinghouse), no development of Parts I, 2 and 5 of Schedule 2 to that Order (or any Order revoking or reenacting that Order) shall be carried out without specific planning permission being obtained.

Reason: To preserve the character of the area. Local Development Plan - Policies 1 - National Park Purposes and Duty, 8 - Special Qualities, 15 - Conservation of the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park and 30 - Amenity.



















